

# Welcome!

NASA Langley 2022 Symposium on Turbulence Modeling: Roadblocks, and the  
Potential for Machine Learning

Suffolk, VA  
27-29 July 2022

# Overview

- This in-person symposium is a follow-on to:
  - UMich/NASA Symposium on Advances in Turbulence Modeling (2017)
    - See: NASA/TM–2017–219682: “Status, Emerging Ideas and Future Directions of Turbulence Modeling Research in Aeronautics”, Duraisamy et al.
  - UMich Symposium on Model-Consistent Data-driven Turbulence Modeling (2021)
- It has 2 themes:
  - Identification of critical issues for Reynolds-averaged Navier-Stokes (RANS) models, as well as possible ways forward
  - A “Collaborative Testing Challenge” for data-driven RANS models

# Overview

- 1<sup>st</sup> Theme (critical issues for RANS):
  - Discuss turbulence modeling from both academic and industrial perspectives
  - New developments in RANS, including advancements enabled by data-driven techniques
  - Synergies between turbulence theory, traditional modeling, experiments, simulations, and emergent ideas
  - Limitations and perceived stagnation of turbulence models
  - Latest developments in turbulence scale-resolving simulation capabilities
  - Transition modeling
- 2nd Theme (collaborative testing challenge):
  - Foster shared understanding of the needs of data-driven model developers, traditional CFD developers, and especially end users
- We were fairly open-ended in our specification of what participants should talk about, so you will see a wide variety
- We have roughly 80-90 attendees
- If we don't have your talk yet, please see me or MC during a break
- The slides will be made public after the meeting
- We are going to try to record the panel discussions

# Agenda Day 1

Wed July 27			
7:30 - 7:45 am	Registration & refreshment/food payments		
7:45 - 8:00 am			
8:00 - 8:15 am			
8:15 - 8:30 am			
8:30 - 8:45 am	Welcome, Intro, Overview	1 hr	
8:45 - 9:00 am			
9:00 - 9:15 am	Bookend talk 1 - <b>SPALART</b>		
9:15 - 9:30 am	An Old-Fashioned Framework for Machine Learning in Turbulence Modeling		
9:30 - 9:45 am	Break		
9:45 - 10:00 am	<b>Knopp, T.:</b> A data-driven wall law for the mean velocity in adverse-pressure gradient and modification of the SSG/LRR-w model	1.75 hrs	RANS related
10:00 - 10:15 am	<b>Abe, H.:</b> Improvement on the AMM model for predicting wing-body juncture flows		
10:15 - 10:30 am	<b>Agarwal, R.:</b> Review and Potential of Wray-Agarwal Family of Turbulence and Transition Models for RANS Simulations		
10:30 - 10:45 am	<b>Fritsch, D.:</b> Measurement and Modeling of Non-Equilibrium Turbulent Boundary Layer Flows		
10:45 - 11:00 am	<b>Lowe, T.:</b> Benchmark Turbulence Modeling Validation Experiments for Three-Dimensional Flows with Separation		
11:00 - 11:15 am	Discussion		
11:15 - 11:30 am			
11:30 - 11:45 am	Lunch		
11:45 - 12:00 noon			
12:00 - 12:15 pm			
12:15 - 12:30 pm			
12:30 - 12:45 pm			
12:45 - 1:00 pm	Invited Talk - <b>HUANG</b>	2 hrs	
1:00 - 1:15 pm	The Anchor Points of Turbulence Modeling		
1:15 - 1:30 pm			
1:30 - 1:45 pm	Panel Discussion - RANS		
1:45 - 2:00 pm	<b>Batten, Durbin, Hirsch, Smith</b>		
2:00 - 2:15 pm	(Moderator: Spalart)		
2:15 - 2:30 pm			
2:30 - 2:45 pm			
2:45 - 3:00 pm	Break		
3:00 - 3:15 pm	Intro to Challenge Case ( <b>Rumsey</b> )	1.75 hrs	
3:15 - 3:30 pm	<b>Stoellinger, M.</b> (talk+Challenge): V&V of DES using multiple CFD codes		Talks including ML Challenge
3:30 - 3:45 pm			
3:45 - 4:00 pm	<b>Cherroud, S.</b> (talk+Challenge): Local Bayesian Mixing of Stochastic Explicit Algebraic Reynolds Stress Models		
4:00 - 4:15 pm			
4:15 - 4:30 pm	Discussion/Day 1 wrapup		
4:30 - 4:45 pm			
4:45 - 5:00 pm			
			4
7:00 PM	NO-HOST DINNER		

# Agenda Day 2

<b>Thu July 28</b>			
8:00 - 8:15 am	Announcements, Coffee		
8:15 - 8:30 am			
8:30 - 8:45 am	Invited Talk - <b>SANDBERG</b>	1.5 hrs	Talks including ML challenge
8:45 - 9:00 am	Evolution of Gene Expression Programming for Turbulence Modelling		
9:00 - 9:15 am			
9:15 - 9:30 am	<b>Fang, Y.</b> (Challenge): Towards more accurate and general turbulence models using CFD-driven training on multiple flows		
9:30 - 9:45 am	<b>Parish, E.</b> (talk+Challenge): A data-driven turbulence modeling framework for the Reynolds-averaged Navier-Stokes equations via discrepancy-based tensor-basis neural networks		
9:45 - 10:00 am			
10:00 - 10:15 am	Break		
10:15 - 10:30 am	<b>Bin, Y. and Li, J.</b> (talk+Challenge): Progressive, extrapolative machine learning in turbulence modeling	1.5 hrs	Talks including ML challenge
10:30 - 10:45 am			
10:45 - 11:00 am	<b>Viswanathan, V.</b> (talk+Challenge): Differentiable Physics for Turbulence Modeling		
11:00 - 11:15 am			
11:15 - 11:30 am	<b>Marepally, K.</b> (Challenge): Field-Inversion Machine Learning Approach for Improved Turbulence and Transition Predictions of Flows Over Airfoils		
11:30 - 11:45 am	<b>Dwight, R.</b> (Challenge): SpaRTA with classification		
11:45 - 12:00 noon	Lunch		
12:00 - 12:15 pm			
12:15 - 12:30 pm			
12:30 - 12:45 pm			
12:45 - 1:00 pm			
1:00 - 1:15 pm	Discussion of Challenge	1 hr	
1:15 - 1:30 pm			
1:30 - 1:45 pm			
1:45 - 2:00 pm			
2:00 - 2:15 pm	Break		
2:15 - 2:30 pm	Invited Talk - <b>HIRSCH</b>	0.75 hrs	
2:30 - 2:45 pm	The HiFi-TURB EU project: vision and progress of ML-based turbulence modeling		
2:45 - 3:00 pm			
3:00 - 3:15 pm	Break		
3:15 - 3:30 pm	<b>Srivastava, V.:</b> Developing hierarchical augmentations via the Learning and Inference assisted by Feature-space Engineering (LIFE) framework	1.25 hrs	ML
3:30 - 3:45 pm	<b>Orkwis, P.:</b> Using LES/DNS data for Neural Network-based Improvement of Existing Turbulence Models		
3:45 - 4:00 pm	<b>Romano, J.:</b> Towards use of convolutional neural networks as a post processing enhancement to RANS modeled turbulence		
4:00 - 4:15 pm	Discussion/Day 2 wrapup		
4:15 - 4:30 pm			
4:30 - 4:45 pm			
4:45 - 5:00 pm		5	

# Agenda Day 3

<b>Fri July 29</b>			
8:00 - 8:15 am	Announcements, Coffee		
8:15 - 8:30 am			
8:30 - 8:45am	<b>Eisfeld, B.</b> (presented by <b>Knopp</b> ): Potential of Data Driven Methods for Reynolds Stress Modeling - A Fundamental View	1.5 hrs	ML
8:45 - 9:00 am	<b>Girimaji, S.:</b> Machine Learning, Scale Resolving Simulations and the Future of Predictive Computations of Engineering Flows		
9:00 - 9:15 am	<b>Miller, N.:</b> Data-Driven Calibration of RANS Closure Models with PIV		
9:15 - 9:30 am	<b>Evans, J.:</b> Data-Driven Construction of Iterative Algebraic Reynolds Stress Models using Model-Derived Turbulence Variables		
9:30 - 9:45 am	<b>Banko, A.:</b> Lessons from data-driven Reynolds stress and turbulent scalar flux closures: the roles of anisotropy, auxiliary turbulence equations, and model extrapolation		
9:45 - 10:00 am	<b>Volpiani, P.:</b> Improvement of RANS models by machine learning for a bump configuration		
10:00 - 10:15 am	Break		
10:15 - 10:30 am	Panel Discussion - MACHINE LEARNING	1.5 hrs	
10:30 - 10:45 am	<b>Banko, Cinnella, Dwight, Girimaji, Moser</b>		
10:45 - 11:00 am	(Moderator: <b>Duraisamy</b> )		
11:00 - 11:15 am			
11:15 - 11:30 am			
11:30 - 11:45 am			
11:45 - 12:00 noon	Lunch		
12:00 - 12:15 pm			
12:15 - 12:30 pm			
12:30 - 12:45 pm			
12:45 - 1:00 pm			
1:00 - 1:15 pm	Bookend talk 2 - <b>SPALART</b>	1 hr	
1:15 - 1:30 pm	Conjectures of a Generalized Law of the Wall and a Structural Limitation for Classical Turbulence Models		
1:30 - 1:45 pm	Discussion		
1:45 - 2:00 pm			
2:00 - 2:15 pm	Break		
2:15 - 2:30 pm	<b>Coder, J.:</b> Current Status of PDE-Based Transition Modeling for Aerodynamics Applications	1.75 hrs	Transition
2:30 - 2:45 pm	<b>Durbin, P.:</b> Hybrid closure modeling with laminar to turbulent transition		
2:45 - 3:00 pm	<b>Jee, S.:</b> High-fidelity computational data of transitional boundary layers for a data-driven approach		
3:00 - 3:15 pm	Panel Discussion - TRANSITION		
3:15 - 3:30 pm	<b>Xiao, Duraisamy</b>		
3:30 - 3:45 pm	(Moderator: <b>Durbin</b> )		
3:45 - 4:00 pm			
4:00 - 4:15 pm	Break		
4:15 - 4:30 pm	Final Discussion & Wrapup	0.5 hr	
4:40 - 4:45 pm			
4:45 - 5:00 pm			
		6	

# Social

- **Group Photo:** Will be taken at our first break today; please remove your name tags and leave all personal belongings at your seat; masks can come off for the photo
- **Lunches:** If you signed up ahead of time, a boxed lunch will be available for you
- **No-host dinner Wed night:**
  - Gianna's (7386 Harbour Towne Parkway)
  - Event begins @ 6:30pm – enjoy a drink and socialize
  - Dinner will be served at 7:00pm
  - We have the area of the restaurant by the bar all to ourselves. You will be given a place card with your name & meal choice. You are welcome to sit anywhere you like in our area of the restaurant.
- **Drivers/Rides for dinner:** Sign-up sheets will be with MC

If you have not signed up for dinner or have changed any of your meal plans, please see MC at the break

# Philippe R. Spalart (PRS)

- This Symposium was also originally conceived as a way to honor Philippe R. Spalart's contributions to the turbulence modeling field
- He is delivering both our first and last plenary talks
- PRS Introduction